I. Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University Institute of European Studies

Ana Titvinidze

Female Migrants in the European Union

European Studies

Thesis is written to gain master degree in European Studies

Dr. Tamaz Zubiashvili Associated professor

Tbilisi 2011

Table of Contents

3
4
. 8
. 8
. 9
. 9
. 12
. 15
. 16
. 18
20
25
25
30
34
36
41
. 44
47

Abstract

The thesis focuses on the female migration into the European Union. Its particular aim is to study the conditions of the third country national women migrants in the EU. Female migrants are involved in several kinds of employment sectors in their host countries like service sector, domestic work including cleaning houses and caretaking, prostitution. I decided to pay specific attention to the sphere of domestic work since a big number of migrant women are employed in private households. It is argued by some scientists that female migrants gain empowerment through migration. Still, working in the destination countries of the EU is mostly associated with professional downgrading resulted from irrelevance of migrants' educational attainment or qualification and the type of work they perform. In my research I tried to show whether empowerment is the main pull factor for female migrants or the economic benefit is a stronger driver of women migration flows even in the conditions of migrant's professional degradation. With this end I studied the case of the Spain where a great number of Latin American women is employed in the domestic work sector. Then I analyzed the results of my study within the framework of the normative migration theory elaborated by Nelson. Afterwards I was enabled to submit my conclusions about the researched sphere.

Introduction

Population migration has always been present in the history of mankind. People left their countries to explore new lands, escape natural disasters, political persecutions, wars or conflicts. However, these movements of population have not always been analyzed from the migration viewpoint. The regulation of people's movement across national borders has started since the 20th century.

International migration defined as the movement of people from one country into another to take up residence is a relatively recent development.¹ It occurs from developing countries to developed ones or within the greater regions. Nowadays almost all the countries participate in the process of migration either as migrant sending or migrant receiving countries.

The 20th century is regarded as the "age of migration"² by many scholars. Indeed, last decades have observed a growing number of migrant flows. More and more people migrate from less developed to well developed countries in order to find better economic conditions and support their families back home more efficiently. It is generally acknowledged that the main driver of migration is an economic reason. However, there can be identified some other factors like cases of family reunification or the existence of close relatives or friends in foreign countries as invoking the desire to migrate. Apart from desired migration people cross national borders due to civil wars or wars among the states, political upheaval, political or ethnic persecutions or natural calamities. In this case people become refugees or asylum seekers.

The European Union has recently become one of the main destinations for immigrant sending countries. Migration occurs not only from the third countries but between the EU member states as well. According to Eurostat estimates of 1 January 2009, the total number of non-nationals, people who are not citizens of their country of residence, living on the territory of EU member states was 31.8 million representing 6.4 % of the EU-27's population. Compared to the previous year estimates the migrants' number was increased as it was 30.8 million or 6.2% of the total population previously. Though more than 1/3 or a total of 11.9 million persons of all non-nationals living in the EU 27 on

¹ Philip Martin and Gottfried Zuercher

² Castles and Miller

1.01.09 were citizens of a different member state from the one where they were living, the share of third country national migrants was quite important.³ It is also notable that some Western European countries namely southern countries of Spain, Italy and Greece have recently transformed from migrant sending to migrant receiving countries.

Among the migrants living in the European Union the number of females is on the increase. In compliance with the United Nations estimates, almost a third of the total 200 million migrants worldwide stream to Europe and female migrants represent 49.6% of the total number. Thus feminization, one of the recent trends of international migration is noteworthy. From one point of view the presence of the female migrants is not a completely new phenomenon as women were living in the countries other than those of their origin in earlier centuries as well. But they were seen as followers of male migrants with the aim of family reunification and were only regarded as dependants on their male relatives. Consequently their participation in economic activities was not taken into account. So they were rather invisible agents in migration flows. However, since 1970s women's role, as an active and independent actor has emerged in the migration studies. The reason why scientist paid specific attention to the female migration was that women started to migrate not only as the dependants on their fathers or husbands but on their own either. Growing numbers of women are crossing national borders in search of employment so that to be able to support their families economically. The trend underlines an increasing female participation in household planning and activities as well as newly emerging female role as a breadwinner of the family. Exactly an independent "women on the move"⁴ is meant by the scholars when speaking about the feminization of migration.

Migrant women in the European Union states like in other destination countries of the world face complex challenges. In my opinion their professional degradation or deskilling is the most urgent issue as female migrants generally get employed insecure spheres like domestic work, caretaking or sex work which makes them vulnerable in comparison with migrant man or females of their host countries.

³ http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu; 2009

⁴ Yvonne Riano: "Women on the Move to Europe. A Review of the Literature on Gender and Migration;" p.2

As the issue of female migrants in private households is the main subject of my thesis I would underline the circumstances of the third country national women engaged in the domestic work. Quite often domestic workers from Non-EU countries, especially from the countries of former Soviet Union, Yugoslavia or Latin America, have a good level of education as they own high school, college and even university diplomas as well as some vocational gualifications with or without experience. Nevertheless, chances for them to find jobs equivalent to their qualification are minor if any. Still, they are needed in the society as female migrants represent a source for EU national women to take up working careers and free themselves from the burden of household activities. Employing a female migrant host country national women transfer their family responsibilities to other women and themselves become active participants on the job market. Different from female migrants they get jobs relevant to their educational attainment and benefit from the upward opportunities related to their professional and career development. For the sake of economic benefits third country nationals take up low-paid, unprivileged jobs which they would not accept living in their countries of origin. Their wages though lower still make an important amount in their home-countries and female migrants accept to perform otherwise unacceptable jobs because of remittances they make to their home countries for the wellbeing of their families. On the other side we see women from the host countries which take advantage of the migrant females and build up their careers. So the gap in the household is filled with the employment of third country nationals who represent a relatively cheap and more employer dependant workforce. So these two types of women fit together and fill the needs of each other, however one side – migrants is disadvantaged while the other side – host country nationals are advantaged.

Here I would apply the Normative Migration Theory elaborated by Douglas Nelson. According to him, states pursue the policy which can be characterized by the following factors: a home-resident-first-rule, home-resident-first-immigrant-welfare-second and priority-of-home-resident-rule. Considering the conditions of non-EU national female migrants from the perspective of this theory, it can be said that due to the protection of professional ambitions of the host country national women, non-EU female migrants are not allowed to take up the jobs suitable to them. Otherwise they become the competitors of nationals on the job market thus minimizing the professional opportunities and fostering unemployment among the EU national women. On the whole neither the state policy which protects the interests and priorities of its nationals nor the societies of the host countries are willing to employ third-country national women in the areas other than with low paid, less privileged working conditions. I will further elaborate on the issue in the theory part.

My research is divided into three parts. Each chapter focuses on a particular issue concerning the area I am interested in. At the beginning, in the first chapter I describe the trend of feminization of migration in the European Union in general and deal with the conditions under which the third country migrant women find themselves in the EU countries. In the second chapter I bring the case of migrant women from Latin America in Spain and try to demonstrate living and working conditions of non-EU national migrants in this one specific country, which in my opinion can be used to portray the circumstances of immigrants EU-wide. After that, in the third chapter I try to apply the normative migration theory to explain the migration outcomes and the conditions of migrant females in their host countries. Finally I provide the conclusions with the help of which I try to support my hypothesis.

Methodology

For my study I use the qualitative research methods namely: description, analysis and case study. In order to be able to obtain the necessary data for my paper I used the works of different authors regarding the migration and gender issues. I also used statistical information from various sources as well as researches and studies conducted by the European Union, International organization of Migration, International Labor Organization and the Centre for Comparative Migration Studies.

Research Question and Hypothesis

The main area of interest for my paper is women's migration into the European Union. The number of migrating females is increasing and it is now generally acknowledged in the scholarly literature that migrant women are becoming from invisible to visible agents. Though, one should mention as well that scientists first started to pay specific attention to this topic and distinguished females as independent actors in the migration processes some three decades ago.

From the existing literature it is clear that the third country national migrant women in the European Union do not experience the same opportunities as the women who are nationals of their host countries or the migrant women who are the nationals of the EU country other than the one where they are residing. Nevertheless the European Union seems to be a favorite destination for the women of Eastern and Central European, Asian, African or Latin American countries. Therefore, my research question is the following: What are the benefits and opportunities for the third country national migrant women in the EU? Making efforts to provide the answer to this question I tried to assert my hypothesis which is stated in the following way: In the EU migrant women from the third countries experience professional downgrading because of their involvement in the domestic work. While proving this hypothesis I also attempted to partly challenge the idea of empowerment through migration.

Chapter 1. General overview of women migrants in the European Union

In this chapter I refer to the issue of women migrants in general. As I intend to look at the phenomenon of female migration in the European Union from the second half of the twentieth century, at first I focus on the main migration periods which were prevalent in Europe during this period. As the paper concerns voluntary migrant women whose aim is to start participation in the labor markets of their host countries I try to show which EU member states are considered by the researchers as being the main destination countries for potential migrants and proceed with discussing the countries of southern Europe which have recently become migrant-receiving states. Each group has its characteristic approach to the new comers and their involvement in the workforce. Afterwards this chapter deals with the female migration which is apparently on the increase in the EU as well as elsewhere in migrant-receiving countries. I also deal with pull and push factors of female migration and the types of female migrants. The last section of this chapter is devoted to the domestic work in the European Union which is the major area of non-EU immigrants employment and which has implications to the professional downgrading. So I try to address living and working conditions of third country national women who arrive in the EU member states in search of better life and opportunities. This enables me to derive a conclusion about the realization of their expectations through migration.

1.1. Main migration periods in Europe

In the second half of the twenties century there were four main periods of migration⁵ in European countries and each of them had their own characteristics.

The first period continued from 1945 to 1973.⁶ At that time, after the end of the Second World War most European states were economically devastated and there was an

⁵ Garson, J.P. "Migration in Europe: Trends and Perspectives;" p.46

⁶ Garson, J.P. "Migration in Europe: Trends and Perspectives;" p.46

urgent need for reconstruction. Under the conditions of sever worker and manpower shortages the governments of European countries favored the kind of migration which was related to employment. During this period people migrated from one European country to another especially from southern European countries of Greece, Portugal, Spain and Italy to west European countries. Though, according to the researchers the number of third country national people was also big among the migrant population. So the labor market needs of western Europe was satisfied with workers from migrant sending countries, which on the other hand, attempted to remedy their economic and unemployment problems through their residents who were earning their livings in other countries. One of the main principles of newly created European Economic Community was free movement of persons among its original six member states. As a result a lot of Italian workers moved to work in the other five member countries. Apart from intra-Community migration, migrant flows increased from the third countries on the basis of bilateral agreements between the countries. "Guest worker" program introduced by the German government during that period is worth particular attention as it fostered the growth of migrant working population. This program was considered mutually beneficial for both sending and receiving countries as the former benefited from migrants' economic and social remittances and the latter filled the labor shortage which was necessary for the reconstruction of many European economies.

It is notable that between the early 1960s and the early 1970s over 30 million foreign workers entered the European Economic Community including temporary workers and multiple entries.

The second period covers the years between 1973 and 1989.⁷ It began with the economic crisis which was related to the growth of oil prices in 1973. Because of the economic downfall the governments of western European countries tried to reduce immigration. At that time employment related migration into the European countries decreased meaningfully although other categories of migration, namely crossing the borders with the aim of family reunification, increased. Despite the efforts of the governments of the host countries the massive return of existing migrants to their home countries did not start. The reason was that the economic situation in third countries was

⁷ Garson, J.P. "Migration in Europe: Trends and Perspectives;" p.47

even worse. As for the intra-Community migration, it remained at the same level because of the economic crisis and the similarities of the amount of salaries in the European Community.

The third period is considered to be between 1990 and 2000.⁸ It is described with the diversification of sending and receiving countries. During that period traditional emigration countries of southern Europe changed into migrant receiving countries. It is acknowledged by the scientists that the countries of southern Europe have not traditionally been identified as favorite destination states for migrants. Rather they were characterized as migrant sending counties to northern and western European states which were economically stronger and more stable. However, southern European countries of Italy, Spain, Portugal, Greece and Cyprus have undergone a change and become receivers of a relatively large numbers of different kinds of migrants recently. It must be mentioned as well that the number of migrants is bigger than officially declared by the statistics. It is due to the existence of undocumented migrants who still penetrate into the countries despite the governments' efforts to control the borders efficiently.

What is more, migrants started to arrive not from only former colonies of the European countries but from a more diverse group of countries from sub-Saharan Africa and Asia as well as from Eastern Europe after the fall of the Soviet Union and from the former Yugoslavia. It is noteworthy that at the beginning of the 1990s the number of asylum applications went up. And as the migration restrictions had become tougher by that time lots of people tried to use the asylum application as a safer channel to enter a certain country.

The fourth period is characterized by the growth of permanent migration and temporary employment related migration which now focuses on skilled workers.⁹ Of course unskilled workers are still important especially in the areas of agriculture, building and public work and domestic services. The recovered interest in the labor migration from the European Union countries standpoint is regarded to be a result of the population aging phenomenon and declining fertility rates in European countries. In addition, the advance of

⁸ Garson, J.P. "Migration in Europe: Trends and Perspectives;" p.47

⁹ Garson, J.P. "Migration in Europe: Trends and Perspectives;" p.48

the sectors like information and technology, health and education demands a great number of skilled and highly skilled labor-force, the shortage of which can be filled through migration. Furthermore, the number of women is also increasing significantly. Presently a growing proportion of female migrants is becoming visible in the categories of labor migration as well as in refugee and asylum-seekers' flows while previously female migration was mostly related to family reunification.

It should be noted that female migrants were present during all the four periods but their existence was not paid proper attention. They were just considered as the followers of their male relatives who did not take independent steps when arriving in the destination countries. It is only in last couple of decades that a woman migrant drew the interest of researchers as being an independent participant in the migration flows whose conditions in host countries should be distinguished from those of a man migrant.

There is also another classification of migration history in the European Union which was elaborated by White. According to him international migration to Europe can be divided into three different waves: labor migration marked by a large-scale movement of single male migrants in search of employment; family reunification which brought different gender and age groups that is women and children to European states as the governments of host countries gave migrant workers legal rights to reunify with their families; and postindustrial migration which is more diverse than previous waves. This wave shows that migrant workers are necessary for the Western European countries due to the aging of population, low fertility rates and early retirement of national labor force.

1.2. Female migrants in the European Union

Among the trends of migration which influenced Europe in the "age of migration", the feminization is regarded to be the most recent phenomenon. However it should be mentioned that a migrant woman herself is not a just emerging actor in the process of population movements. Women as well as men have always been present in the countries other than those of their origin. The fact is that the role of women as independent migrants

was underestimated. They were seen as followers and dependents on their spouses making no economic contribution to their home or host countries because they did not participate in the labor market of the destination countries.

What makes female migration distinguished now is a growing scholarly literature about the issue. For decades scientists have overlooked the women migrants making them invisible in the migration stock but nowadays more and more attention is paid to this point and scientists try to make difference between male and female migrants with respect to the opportunities they enjoy in their host countries, working and living conditions, their integration in the receiving society, the levels of security and vulnerability as well as between the remittances they make to their home countries. Generally speaking migrant receiving countries have migration policies which take the issue of male and female migrants into equal consideration. However, women are considered to be less protected and more vulnerable. These circumstances stem from the fact that third country national migrant women, no matter what their educational attainment or gualifications and working experiences are, get employed mostly in the sectors which are less possible to control. For example, they often work in private households as nannies or take care of the elderly, they work in the service sector in restaurants and cafes mainly as cleaners or they are involved in sex industry. They often experience humiliation, psychological or physical abuse, work extra hours without proper payments and still desire to stay in their host countries further and tolerate the difficulties connected with being an "other" in the receiving society.

Female migrants in the EU come from different developing countries of Asia, South America, Africa and Eastern Europe. There is also intra-community migration among the EU member states. Concerning the conditions of migrants in the host countries the studies have shown that migrant women from one EU country to another are in the same circumstances as the females of the receiving country. As for the third country migrant women or third country migrant men. It is especially true with respect to their job opportunities. Migrant women are needed in the labor markets of the receiving countries due to the increased insertion of local women in economic activities who try to find someone else to perform the household jobs for them. Therefore researches note that women migrants are more noticed to be engaged in one particular area of occupation than men, which limits their possibilities

to socialize with other members of the host society including the both nationals of the receiving country or the immigrants from other counties. Consequently they can be easily isolated when they are employed in such employment sectors and this is especially true about the illegal migrants who become increasingly dependent on their employees. The lack of the knowledge of the receiving county's language also contributes to the hardships of the immigrants.

It is worth mentioning that immigrant women often maintain transnational households meaning that they have strong links with their families particularly if they have young children. As the main reason of migration for married women is the well-being and better future accommodation of their children, they shoulder double responsibilities while working abroad: on the hand they have to fulfill the requirements of their employers which often include childcare and on the other hand, they support their families financially. Their emotional conditions are aggravated by the fact that while raising someone else's child they have their own children left back in their home countries who lack parental care. Consequently they have their relatives like mothers, sisters or the eldest child who look after their children. In some cases migrant women themselves hire other women to perform domestic work in their households and so they become employers and employees at the same time.

When women migrate for the purpose of starting work an important attention is given to the money they send to their families back home. With respect to the remittances, studies show that both categories of economic migrants, men and women, transfer a significant part of their earnings to the sending countries. However, there is a difference in the amount and the ways of use of remittances. They both transfer a certain part of their salaries to their families but in general women send a greater part of their remuneration and leave as less as possible for their personal needs than men despite the fact that men's earnings are higher than females. That is why immigrant women who are involved in the domestic sector prefer to be employed as live-ins, which reduces their personal expenses though at the expense of less privacy, prolonged working hours and more dependency on the employers. In addition, women's remittances are used to cover everyday needs of the family and a significant amount is allocated for their children's education. They tend to remit les for investment compared to men who make efforts to buy land, houses, farms, farm-machinery or cattle. But, of course, there are women who plan to start their business or building houses when they return to the countries of origin.

1.3. Migrant women's labor force participation

Labor force participation rate of third country national migrant women is different from that of native-born women in the same country. According to 2005 anonymised EU Labor Force Survey datase the European Union member states are divided into four groups with respect to third country national migrant females' participation in their labor markets: old migrant receiving countries, new migrant receiving countries, Nordic countries and new members of the Community.¹⁰

The "old" migrant receiving countries such as Belgium, France, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, the United Kingdom and Austria have substantially low participation rates of third country migrant women compared to native-born women. In the "new" migrant receiving countries of Southern Europe such as Greece, Spain and Portugal the labor force participation rates of third country migrant women is higher than that of native-born women. The "Nordic" countries of Denmark and Sweden have different rates depending on the fact whether the migration flows are recent or not. However, their labor force participation patterns are more like those of the "old" migrant receiving countries. Finally, the new member states of Cyprus, Czech Republic and Hungary have diverse labor force participation patterns.

In the labor market migrant women face double disadvantage that is they are women and migrants. Their double disadvantage is evaluated by unemployment, involuntary part-time employment or underemployment and temporary-contract employment. Unemployment and underemployment rates are higher not only between the third-country migrant and native-born women but also between the women and men migrants from third countries.

¹⁰ Rubin, J., Rendal, M.S., Rabinovich, L, Tsang, F., Janta, B., Oranje-Nassau, C.: "Migrant Women in the EU Labor Force;" Summery Findings; RAND Europe; Technical report; p.5

Speaking about the labor force participation of third country migrant women researchers also focus on the occupational segregation and concentration of females.¹¹ Segregation points out that there is a tendency for men and women to be involved in different occupations from each other. Whereas concentration means that a certain groups are present in certain sectors of employment in higher proportions than others. The third country migrant women are mostly employed in service sector such as catering, domestic work and healthcare jobs and to some extent in the manufacturing sector. An important number of them are also involved in prostitution and the sex industry though some of them do these activities forcefully because they are the victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation. Apart from segregation migrant women are concentrated in jobs requiring lower skill which decreases their rights as workers, their chances for building a progressing career and development, especially when the migrants are of good educational or qualification backgrounds. These circumstances underline the fact that even in case of being employed third country migrant women are under the poor conditions which make them socially and economically vulnerable.

Judging from the abovementioned facts I would say that the third country migrant women do not enjoy a vast variety of opportunities in terms of professional development in the EU. They can get involved in those kinds of jobs which are low skilled and which are offered to them because the nationals of the host countries prefer not to take them as they are regarded as low paid and less privileged. Thus according to their employment types it can be said that migrant women are considered as less educated and qualified, and necessary for the receiving countries as long as they can be helpful in facilitating the native women's career progression. Their full integration in the labor market does not occur as they cannot take the jobs relevant to the degree of their education or qualification.

1.4. Push and pull factors of female migration

In the process of migration push and pull factors identified by Lee are important determinants. Push factors refer to the country of origin, whereas pull factors emerge in the

¹¹ Rubin, J., Rendal, M.S., Rabinovich, L, Tsang, F., Janta, B., Oranje-Nassau, C.: "Migrant Women in the EU Labor Force;" Summery Findings; RAND Europe; Technical report; p.8

destination countries. The desire to migrate is related to these factors. Push factors originate in the home countries of potential immigrants and they can be associated with economic crises, low living standards, high unemployment rates, wars and political or social unrest, persecution, discrimination on the basis of race, ethnic origin or gender. These factors are different for men and women particularly in the countries where gender inequality is prevalent. These reasons trigger the individuals' desire to migrate in the countries where they think that their economic or social needs will be better accommodated. Pull factors are connected to the migrant receiving countries and represent the conditions and opportunities existing in host countries which influence the migrants' decision to choose a certain country as a destination.

There are various push factors stated by the researchers which foster the female migration. First of all, the growing female participation in the labor market as a breadwinner of the family should be mentioned. Nowadays more women take an active part in supporting their families economically than in previous years. They are no longer dependent on their spouses' income and perform their responsibilities as housewives together with working with the aim to increase the family income on the whole. Sometimes it happens so that in certain households only women are employed and the whole burden of financial support is on their shoulders. Consequently those women make a decision to migrate in order to support their families more efficiently and guarantee better education and living conditions for their children. Secondly, higher unemployment rates and lower salaries in the developing countries invoke the decision to migrate. This factor leads both married and single women to leaving their home countries. While the main incentive for the married women is better accommodation of their families, the young single women migrate to earn more money for the future, to gain experience and seek adventure. Finally, women from countries with strong gender discrimination traditions migrate to escape sever living conditions which include forced marriages, slavery conditions with no voice to say or the cases of female genital mutilation. In spite of the fact that those women are of guite different backgrounds concerning their education and social life they still choose to migrate to the EU member states to find freedom and live the life of their own.

Among the pull factors which make the European Union a favorite destination for the migrant women from developing countries researchers identify strong and stable economic environment and observation of human rights. Third country migrant women head for the EU because they want to take the advantage of economic benefits they can find there. On the other hand, women from African countries as well as from Muslim countries seek more personal freedom. Of course migrant women know that they will not be welcomed in host countries with the most favorable conditions because due to the development of modern communication systems the exchange of the information has become very easy and through the relatives or friends already living abroad they know what they can expect. Nevertheless relatively higher wages in European countries influence their decision to migrate in search of employment. Thus the economic pull factor overweighs the disadvantage of being occupied in less privileged jobs which would be unattractive for them in their countries of origin. In addition the growing demand in European job markets for the domestic work and service sector provokes the wish to migrate as well. Third country potential migrants who are unemployed in their homelands or are in need of more income go to EU member states where there is a necessity of workforce in low skilled sectors and where they can get jobs.

1.5. Types of migrant women

The "feminization of migration" has also produced specifically female forms of migration, such as the commercialized migration of domestic workers and caregivers, the migration and trafficking of women for the sex industry, and the organized migration of women for marriage.¹² Women are represented in big numbers among the refugees and asylum seekers as well. This type differs from other categories of migrant women because they do not have a desire to migrate and are not motivated to enter the country. All these categories of female migrants are present in the European Union.

In domestic and care work sectors third country migrant women have different kinds of work, working arrangements and living conditions. The type of work can be cleaning, house- keeping, taking care of children or the elderly. They may work in one household or may have several employers. They can be live-in or live-out workers. They can be involved

¹² Economic and Social Council; POP/945; 2006; http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2006/pop945.doc.htm

in au-pair programs or cultural exchanges. So for many women involvement in domestic work sector represents the first step for entering the host country. They hope to change their occupations later and get better paid jobs with better status. However, the majority of them remain in the same sector for years because it is difficult for migrant women to shift into the higher working positions. Females of this category often experience violations of workers' rights and human rights in general. The degree of their dependency on employers is high, particularly if they are illegal migrants. There are cases when migrant women do not receive payment when they work extra hours, the terms of contracts are also violated, they experience humiliation and sexual abuse as well. These facts show that third country migrant women are insecure and vulnerable in the domestic and care sectors.

Third country migrant women are also involved in sex industry. They enter the European Union countries with the aim of working as prostitutes. They cross the borders legally on the basis of various types of visas as well as illegally with the help of human smugglers or traffickers. They choose working in the sex industry either because they have no other alternative or because they regard this sphere as fast-earning and temporary and later on intend to move to another sector. Researchers found out that prostitution is a stratified occupation and is divided into indoor and street prostitution which is further segmented into race, age, income and locale.¹³

A significant number of third country migrant women in the European Union are the victims of human trafficking. They are trafficked with the purpose of sexual exploitation as well as forceful employment in other types of occupation such as working in restaurants and the food processing industry. This type of migration is associated with particularly sever working and living conditions and violation of human rights. According to the studies the majority of women who become the victims of traffickers are deceived. They are cheated on the following grounds: an offer of employment without sex industry connotations; an offer of marriage; an offer to be a singer or dancer in the entertainment industry; or the deception about conditions in which a woman will undertake prostitution. They are forced to get involved in prostitution or enslaved in other kinds of occupations after they are brought in the destination countries. Non-existence of legal status or residence permits aggravates their conditions. It is notable that once they manage to

¹³ Kontos, M.(2009) "Integration of Female Migrants in Labour Market and Society;" p.54

escape they are eager to cooperate with law enforcement agencies. They are given temporary residence permits which is necessary for them to act as witnesses during court sessions. Unfortunately, the current legislation which deals with trafficking is focused on prosecuting the criminals and less attention is paid to the protection of the victims of trafficking.

The movement of women with the purpose of marriage is one more form of female migration which is present in the EU. Women from developing countries tend to seek marriage partners in Europe because men there are associated with having better qualities. Better equality between man and women and more freedom also determine the potential migrant women's desire to get married in the EU member state where they can become economically and socially better accommodated. Recently the phenomenon of "mail order brides" has become visible. Men from developed countries try to find their future spouses in less developed and poor parts of the world. These kinds of marriages are usually planned without any contact between the future spouses before the marriage. The partners get in touch with each other with the help of relatives or special agencies. The existence of Internet greatly supports the establishment of such marriages as well. Migration for the purpose of getting married is not always safe, though. Migrant women may become the victims of traffickers

1. 6. Domestic work in the European Union

In general theorists have taken two approaches towards domestic work. First focuses on unpaid work at home and the second on paid domestic labor.¹⁴ The tasks what domestic workers have to perform in the private households are not defined exactly because of the variety of responsibilities assigned to them. According to the International Labor Organization (ILO) the tasks of a domestic worker/cleaner include: a) sweeping, vacuum-cleaning, polishing and washing the floors and furniture, or washing windows and other fixtures; b) washing, ironing and mending linen and other textiles; c) washing dishes;

¹⁴ Dr Jekyll & Mrs Hyde "defining domestic work"; Anderson, B. "Doing the Dirty Work: The Global Politics of Domestic Labor;" p.9

d) preparing, cooking and serving meals and refreshments; e) purchasing food and other performing related tasks; f) performing related tasks; g) supervising other workers.¹⁵ However, in the European Union domestic workers also perform care work that is looking after the elderly people and children, which is not included in the ILO classification.¹⁶

Domestic work is a sector of employment which attracts a growing number of female migrants in the countries of European Union as well as everywhere in migrant receiving countries. It is acknowledged by the researchers that this is one of the largest areas of occupation which is dominated by the female workers and where the workers are least protected under international and national legislations. Thousands of women from developing countries are employed in the domestic work sector to provide their families financially.

The first definition of domestic work was identified by the experts at the International Labor organization (ILO) meeting in 1951. According to the definition a domestic worker is a "wage earner working in a (private) household, under whatever method and period of remuneration, who may be employed by one or several employers, and who receives no pecuniary gain from this work".¹⁷ Still there is not a definition of domestic work which is universally agreed. The tasks which domestic workers perform are different as well and the responsibilities assigned to them vary from country to country. However, according to the ILO working paper the following more or less common characteristics are identified: domestic work is a growing phenomenon in terms of the number of people who are involved in it; it is mostly done by women and is not sufficiently valued in social and economic terms; it is isolated and often connected with emotional hardships; it includes different tasks which are generally considered to be low skilled; the relationship between employers and employees is specific; it is often performed in the informal economy which is not well regulated; and it is dominated by migrant workers.

According to Professor Helma Lutz domestic work "is marked by the following aspects: the intimate character of the social sphere where the work is performed; the social construction of this work as a female gendered area; the special relationship between

¹⁵ Source: ILO International Standard Classification of Occupations Geneva 1990

¹⁶ Dr Jekyll & Mrs Hyde "defining domestic work"; Anderson, B. "Doing the Dirty Work: The Global Politics of Domestic Labor;" p.15

¹⁷ Gallotti, M. "The Gender Dimension of Domestic Work in Western Europe;" International Migration Papers No.96; p1

employer and employee which is highly emotional, personalized and characterized by mutual dependency, and the logic of care work, (which) is clearly different from that of other employment areas."

Professor Helma Lutz also identifies the following trends regarding the domestic work in today's Europe: firstly, increasing demand for the workforce in the domestic sector has contributed the most to the feminization of migration; secondly, migration takes place according to East to West and South to North pattern, which means that people migrate from Eastern Europe to Western, Southern and Northern Europe; and from Latin America, Asia and Africa to the EU countries respectively; thirdly, migrant women nowadays are more educated. Some of them are from middle-class background and some have higher education. They often migrate independently in order to support their families. Migrant women's educational level and the fact that they move after years of educational training or professional experience makes some researchers to speak about "care drain"; finally, women migrate not because they want to settle in a new place but in order to support their families. She says that Saskia Sassen referred to the growing migration flows as the "counter geographies of globalization" in which migration can be seen as a defensive measure against the difficulties in the transition period.¹⁸

The researchers point out that the domestic workers could be divided into three subcategories: live-in, live-out and casual or hourly paid domestic workers.¹⁹ The working and living conditions for each subcategory are different.

One more characteristic of domestic work is also the fact that employers and employees are both women. The former delegate their household responsibilities to the latter. The growing need for domestic worker in the countries of the European Union is a result of increasing participation of EU national women in the labor market. In the last decades big attention has been given to the achievement of gender equality in the workforce which also includes a rise of female representation in the job markets. European women nowadays are more actively engaged in working activities. They try to pursue their professional careers and at the same time they have to take care of their families. As for the majority of them it is difficult to combine work and household activities together, they

¹⁸ Lutz, H. "Migration and domestic work: A European perspective on a Global theme; " p. 3

¹⁹ Gallotti, M. "The Gender Dimension of Domestic Work in Western Europe;" International Migration Papers No.96; p3

prefer to hire someone who will relieve their burden at home. The employee in the household usually becomes a female migrant who performs cleaning, cooking, childcare or some other kind of work in the family. So the availability of third country migrant workers enables the women of host countries to build up their professional careers. As the domestic workers undertake jobs in private households which frequently involves taking care of the children employers prefer to hire the individuals with some kind of educational backgrounds. In her work: "At your service madam! The globalization of domestic service" Helma Lutz mentions: "If women want to work in a foreign country, they are expected to have received training in their home country, to speak foreign languages (mainly English) or to have at least the skills to find their way around in a foreign country". Women from some developing countries who have diplomas and certificates of high schools or colleges and sometimes even universities are generally preferred to be employed in households which results in their professional downgrading because of the irrelevance of their jobs and education or qualification. Thus it can be said that the growing participation of the host country females in the labor market happens at the expense of third country migrant women's deskilling which is explained as a progressive loss of professional competences because the work they perform is considered to be less privileged and of low status.

The fact that domestic work is not recognized as a real work and is given a low value stems from the past experience. Historically, it has attracted the poorest and the least educated women from rural areas who wanted to escape from poverty.²⁰ Unfortunately this perception of domestic workers has been maintained in the modern world and it creates psychological pressure on third country migrant workers who have undertaken some kinds of education in their countries of origin.

It should be mentioned that the third country domestic workers are increasingly dependent on their employers because their visas are issued on the basis of their employment and in case of being unemployed they will not be able to prolong their visas once they are expired. So the employers have a powerful control mechanism over the immigrant domestic workers. The power can be direct and unmediated or mediated: the first case refers to the undocumented immigrants whose employers have the power to

²⁰ Dobner, M. and Tappert S. (2010): "Female migrant domestic workers and their Spanish employers in times of crisis: A comparative analysis of consequences for women on both sides of the coin." p.6

"report and deport," the second case refers to the workers who have legal status whose employers can withdraw an employment confirmation letter and ensure their deportation by so doing.²¹

According to the researchers it often happens that migrant women who are involved in the domestic and care work sectors consider their working positions as temporary. When they head abroad in search of better lives for themselves and their families behind they think that they will work in private households for a short period of time and use this opportunity as a starting point for future mobility in the labor market. Therefore they tolerate the humiliation and abusive conditions which are related to working in these areas. As the time goes by and it becomes apparent that they have no chances of changing their jobs and getting employed in better professions then the situation for them grows harder. Being overqualified for the activities they perform in their host families and not recognition of their educational attainment in a proper way results in their underestimation and I would say that this fact overweighs the discourse about third country migrant female's gender empowerment as not all the females are represented from countries where women are overwhelmingly discriminated and poorly treated. In addition their dependence on their employees, fears for deportation, becoming jobless or getting into the worse working conditions reduce their freedom of choice. Their decision-making power is also limited because they cannot abandon their jobs or behave in a too demanding way towards their employees as it will result in their unemployment or exclusion from the country, which will negatively influence their financial circumstances. I would say that all these factors contribute more to disempowerment than empowerment.

²¹ Anderson, B. (2006): "A Very Private Business: Migration and Domestic Work;" Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, Working Paper No 28; p.12

Chapter 2: Case of Spain

I decided to discuss the case of Spain because it has recently become a country of destination for immigrants. Other EU member states such as Germany, France, the Netherlands or the United Kingdom have a longer history of migration inflows which counts several decades. Spain, on the contrary, faced first immigration waves in the 1980s which intensified in 1990s and the trend continues up to now. In addition, women's insertion in the labor market in Spain took place later than in other advanced EU countries. While at the beginning of 1980s the Spanish women's participation in the workforce was only 33 per cent compared to 55 per cent in France or the UK, within the 25-years-time this indicator increased up to 58 per cent.²² This process took place together with the growing Latin American immigration in the country among which women represented the majority. Thus, transformation into the migrant receiving country, the growth of the labor force participation of the Spanish women and the feminization of migration occurred simultaneously within three decades in Spain. This situation makes the country's case interesting as however it is a new-comer among the migrant receiving states, Spain is characterized by the processes which shape the immigration into the EU countries in general. The first section of this chapter gives a general overview of immigration processes in Spain, which is similar to other Southern European countries which have recently become receivers of growing immigrant flows. Then I describe the domestic work sector in Spain which is dominated by the Latin American women and show that domestic work is characterized by almost the same factors as in other EU member states despite the fact that Spain is a new immigration country. Then I focus on the Spanish welfare state's impact on the domestic workers. The final section of the chapter deals with the Spanish immigration regime.

2.1. General overview of immigration in Spain

Spain has become a destination for migrants for the last three decades. Before, it was mainly a migrant sending country first to America and later to Western and Central European countries. However, nowadays this Southern European country receives a great number of migrants from different parts of the world. Migration flows in Spain are mostly

²² Anton, J.I. & Bustillo, R.: "Raining Stones? Female Immigrants in the Spanish Labor Market;" p.4

dominated by the immigrants from Latin America, non-EU European countries and Maghreb (Morocco). According to the data of the Spanish Institute of Statistics the number of immigrants in 2008 constituted approximately 11.4% of the total population. Compared to the 1996 data, when the percentage of migrants represented 1.45, we can see the growth of migration flows. Among the immigrants who live in Spain a significant number is represented by women. So the researchers say that feminization of migration is notable in Spain as well.

Immigrant women from Latin America constitute the majority among the third country migrant females. They participate in Spain's labor market and are mainly involved in the domestic service. The demand in the domestic service for the migrant labor is comparatively bigger in Southern European countries and as Spain is one of them, consequently migrant women are mostly employed by the private households. Among the types of the domestic workers the live-in pattern is more prevalent. It is useful for migrant women especially in case of their illegal migration because strict control of private households is harder for the authorities and there is less possibility of identification of illegally residing migrants. In addition, live-in work minimizes migrant females' living expenses in the host country and they are able to remit more money to their families back home.

Migration from Latin American countries into the European Union and the growing female participation in this process is a recognized fact by the researchers. It must be mentioned that Europe is not a traditional destination for Latin Americans. People from this region generally migrated to the United States or in the countries of the same region. It was only last two decades of the 20th century that the European Union member states emerged as migrant receiving countries from Latin America. Potential migrants choose different countries of the EU as their destinations. However, I decided to concentrate on their migration to Spain, because relationships between this country and those from Latin America are not newly established. Historically the Spanish are closer to them then other EU member states such as Switzerland, Italy or the United Kingdom, for instance, where a big number of Latin American immigrants are noticeable as well. Due to the fact that previously people from Spain migrated into Latin America, brought their culture and what is the most important, their language, moving to Spain is associated with less difficulties for

potential migrants than in other countries, whose culture and language are quite strange for them. Though these pull factors do not make Latin American migrant women's life much easier in Spain than for migrants from other migrant sending countries, it still plays an important role when the future migrants decide to go abroad in search of better life and opportunities. The increase of migrant flows from Latin American countries is attributed to the poverty and economic difficulties in the region as well as to the adoption of stricter migration policies by the United States. Latin American migrant women are characterized by higher rate of participation in the labor market and strong remitting behavior.

When speaking about the Latin American migration in the European Union, researchers point out previous ties between this region and Europe. European conquerors and people willing to live in another place started to move to Latin America in the beginning of the 16th century and influenced the history of the people who lived on the territories before the process of colonization started. Europeans have also influenced the development of independent nations which emerged after the revolutions at the beginning of the 18th century. In the 19th and the beginning of the 20th centuries millions of Europeans mostly from Southern European countries headed for Latin America. For example, Argentina received 6 million emigrants between 1880 and 1920.²³ But nowadays the situation has reversed and Europe has become the recipient of migrants from this region. It is notable that Latin American migrants were present in European countries because of its political and cultural influence on the region. Some young people from Latin America received their education in Europe. What is more, during the conflicts and dictatorship regimes a lot of intellectuals, artists and politicians found refuge in Europe. However, it was in the 80^s of the 20th century that Europe and particularly Spain emerged as a destination for migrants in the context of migration for economic reasons, which implies involvement of migrants in the labor market. The trend has been on the increase since then.

The exact number of Latin American immigrants living in Spain is difficult to estimate because not all of them enter the country legally and undocumented migrants are not registered by the official statistics. Migrants from some countries are not taken into consideration while making estimations because they do not constitute a significant number, therefore the table presented below provides rough statistics.

²³ Nieves, P. & Marie, A. "Bolivian Migrants in Spain; Between Globalization and a Colonial Past"

Nationality	Spain			
	1986	1991	1996	2001
Ecuador	-	-	2.9	84.7
Peru	2.2.	6.5	18.0	33.8
Colombia	3.4	5.3	7.9	48.7
Argentina	12.2	20.0	4.2	20.4

Table 1: South American population stock in Spain by nationality (in thousands)

Source: Trends in International Migration: SOPEMI 2003 Edition, OECD, 2004.

	Total	Men	Women	% Women
Argentina	47,656	23,646	24,010	50.4
Bolivia	11,311	5,084	6,227	55.1
Brazil	18,305	5,575	12,730	69.5
Chile	14,126	6,772	7,354	52.1
Colombia	160,096	67,320	92,776	58.0
Ecuador	216,465	105,889	110,576	51.1
Mexico	8,892	3,567	5,325	59.9
Paraguay	1,112	400	712	64.0
Peru	38,532	15,683	22,849	59.3
Uruguay	9,745	4,809	4,936	50.7
Venezuela	18,370	7,796	10,574	57.6
Other South America	166	84	82	49.4

Table 2: Foreigners in Spain from Latin America by citizenship and sex

Source: National Institute of Statistics, (www.ine.es), Population Census, 2001.

In the 80s and 90s of the last century among the Latin American migrants, women were represented in bigger numbers than men as the feminization of migration characterized the inflows from this region to Spain as well. Though the researchers have observed, that in recent years the number of men and women from Latin America has more or less balanced compared to migrants from other countries of origin.

Legally living Latin American women in Spain have residence permits. Official statistics generally cover the information about them therefore real number of migrant females are usually higher than estimated. Eleonore Kofman identifies three reasons which explain this fact: firstly, the existence of undocumented migrants. As women are mostly employed in the domestic sector or sex work, they remain invisible for the official data collecting sources; secondly, marriage with the national of Spain gives migrants the opportunities of getting citizenship quickly. Though it must be mentioned that Latin American women do not massively enter Spain with the purpose of marrying, there often comes a possibility of a marriage after living in the country for a certain period; thirdly, Latin American migrants claim EU citizenship on the basis of having European ancestors, which gives them right to live and work in the host country. Among this type of people the highest numbers are represented by Argentinians, Brazilians, Cubans, Mexicans, and Venezuelans. The existence of so called "return migrants" is not considered in the statistics either. It is worth mentioning, that in 2000 Spain amended its naturalization law so as to facilitate granting of the Spanish nationality to the second generation descendants of Spanish citizens. What is more, Latin American migrants need only 2 years, compared to 10 years for other third country migrants, of legal residence in Spain for the acquisition of citizenship.

In Spain the first migrant women from the third countries represented Morocco, the Dominican Republic and Peru. They were mainly occupied in the domestic sector in the last two decades of the 20th century. Later, from the beginning of the 21st century, the migrant flows became more diversified and there was an increase in immigration from Ecuador, Colombia, Argentina, Bolivia and Brazil.

From the very beginning Latin American migration was feminized and women constituted the majority of the migrants from the region. This trend is explained by the fact that there was a great demand for the domestic workers in the 1980s and 1990s in Spain, particularly in big cities like Madrid and Barcelona and the immigration policies also supported the arrival of migrant women. Also, the economic crisis in the late 1990s affected the construction sector and therefore labor market accommodated female migrants more than men.

Latin American women who were willing to enter Spain with the purpose of finding jobs got engaged in the live-in domestic service. As on the one hand, it provides free living space, and on the other hand, it is convenient for undocumented migrants because of the lack of inspection. Women tended to enter Spain on the three month tourist visa and when it expired they remained in the country illegally. Live-in work has its disadvantages, for example, not enough personal space, unlimited working hours, greater exploitation or dependency on the employers. Still, Latin American migrants used to enter this sector in order to use it as a starting point for settling in the country. They often planned to change their jobs later, after they had saved enough money. However, as migrant working women had families in their countries of origin whose financial support was the first priority for them, they did not pay attention to their upward mobility in the labor market.

2.2. Domestic work in Spain

Researchers have observed that immigrants in Spain face a notable degree of occupational segmentation. Therefore female immigrants are mostly represented in the domestic work sector. As the immigration flows from Latin America in Spain are mostly dominated by Peruvians, Ecuadorians and Colombians, it can be said that women from these three countries, and particularly from Ecuador, are in the majority. Different studies show that the Spanish women prefer to have domestic workers of the Latin American origin in their households, because they are perceived by the recipient society as being more loving and care-giving. This factor plays an important role because when it comes to the opening doors to the strangers the Spanish women give advantage to those who are considered to be more reliable, responsible and attentive, especially when the domestic workers are charged with taking care of the children or the elderly.

Domestic work is an important component in the Spanish labor market. Today the country has the highest number of registered domestic workers in the EU the majority of which are women. The demand in this sector is on the growth and it is supplied by the migrant workforce in general, the constitution of which is mostly Latino American because females from this region outnumber the migrants from other countries. Researchers identify three reasons for a growing involvement of migrant women in the Spanish domestic service: migrant networks, Spanish migration policies and changes in family structures and gendered division of labor market.

Since 1970 Spain has undergone deep political, economic, demographic and social changes such as transition from the Franco dictatorship to a democracy, the accession in the European Community, an economic growth which caused an increase of the informal economy, rising numbers of aging population, falling fertility rates, insertion of women in the labor market and privatization of the social system since 1980s. Increased participation of native females in the workforce did not reduce their responsibility for family care. Therefore Spanish national women resolved the problem by employing migrant women for the domestic work. In Spain married women are considered to be housewives who can take care of their families and consequently the state does not provide sufficient facilities for the elderly people, the disabled and the children. Because of this migrant domestic workers are increasingly in demand by the Spanish women who want to combine work and family care. However, domestic workers are not always necessary for the combination of these two responsibilities. For the high class females having a domestic worker is often associated with luxury and is a symbol of prestige as they can delegate housework to someone else and find more free time for leisure activities for themselves. One more element that contributes to the increased employment of migrant workers in the domestic work sector is their availability for low wages, which enables middle-class families to have an employee in their households.

Domestic work is not a new phenomenon in Spain. It was performed by the Spanish citizens from rural area. At present due to the increased rates of education among the nationals of Spain this sector is mostly occupied by the migrants. The fact that females from Latin America represent the majority of employees in this area is explained by the positive selective policies toward them, which means that Latin American migrant women

are favored by the migration policies while granting entry into the country, work and residence permits, and through the process of regularization. But it must be mentioned as well, that the migrant domestic workers are highly dependent on their employers because work and resident permits are given to them on the basis of employers demand and can be lost in case of changing or losing their jobs. In addition, an important number of migrant women are not regularized and are excluded from the access to the social welfare system. Thus, Latin American migrant women are still under vulnerable conditions despite the fact that the Spanish migration policies give them advantage over the migrants from other non-EU countries.

The conditions of the domestic workers can be negatively influenced by the economic developments in the host countries, because their payments depend on the income of private households and as the case of Spain demonstrates they may not get pay rise. The number of the Latin American female migrants did not decrease during the recent economic crisis. It is because the domestic sector where the majority of the migrant women are employed was not affected too severely by the crisis. While some of the male migrants became unemployed or decided to return to their countries of origin females remain employed. Some of the married migrant couples made the decision according to which a husband goes back and a wife stays in Spain due to the fact that the former became unemployed as the crises hit the construction or some other sectors where the migrant men are mostly concentrated whereas the demand for the migrant women's labor in the domestic work remained stable. However, studies show that female migrants, and particularly undocumented ones, became more unprotected and vulnerable which can be explained by the fact that the working conditions are becoming worse because of the crises. Female migrants perform the same or more amount of work for the same or even less salary and there is no hope for the payment rise. What is more, they have to accept these circumstances for fear of losing their jobs, which will result in remitting no money to their families back home. It should also be mentioned that for Latin American women access to residence permits depends on the employment which will be lost if they remain without jobs for a long period of time. Therefore they cannot be too demanding towards their employers, they do not even try to address the issue about the increase of the salary and wait until the employers themselves start speaking about it. The aggravation of the situation is as well apparent by the fact, that they have fewer opportunities to shift to other kinds of jobs. Some of the females who moved to other sectors became unemployed during the crisis and they had to return to the domestic work as it was the only option offered to them by the relevant agencies. Thus, during the crisis the dependency of the Latin American migrant women on their employers became more obvious. They had to accept unfavorable or humiliating working conditions because they were afraid of unemployment or getting into the job which would appear to be worse than their current job. Despite its disadvantages the domestic work sector is still dominated by the migrants from Latin America. This fact confirms once again that the Spanish labor market is segmented according to gender and females from the third countries are distributed in the occupational niches.

Women from Latin America who are involved in the domestic work have different educational backgrounds. But they generally have higher levels than immigrant females from other regions, like Asia or Africa. Nearly all of the immigrants completed secondary education and some of them have even university diplomas. Nevertheless, they have to perform the work for which they are overgualified. It is a result of non-recognition of certificates and professional experiences of the women gained in their countries of origin. Though it must be said that this fact is true only about the immigrants from the third countries and migrant women from other EU member states do not face these obstacles and they enjoy the same rights as the Spanish nationals. Furthermore, according to studies a certain number of women in the domestic sector represent such Latino American families who can afford for domestic workers themselves. These women decided to migrate because they wanted to improve their households' conditions and build a better future for their children. The fact that they found jobs in the domestic sector did not meet their expectations due to the irrelevance of their working place and level of education. Yet, they have to perform the responsibilities of domestic workers as the Spanish labor market in most cases offers them the opportunity to take up jobs in this area. Obviously these circumstances point at the professional degradation of the immigrant women who had better status jobs in their home countries but as a result of economic hardships had to abandon their families and head for Spain in order to get financial resources for their families there. As regards their employers in the host society, the Spanish women also consider that the immigrants have undergone many difficulties as the majority of them experience a decline in their social and professional status because working in the private households has implications to both of these factors. Thus, it can be said that the hard circumstances of immigrant women, is a recognized fact by the both, employers and employees.

2.3. The Spanish welfare state and immigrant female domestic workers

It is recognized that immigrants conditions in the receiving countries are under the influence of two factors: the rights to the access to the labor market and the state welfare model. The EU member states belong to the four types of welfare model: the Nordic, the Anglo-Saxon, the Continental and the Southern European or the Mediterranean.²⁴ The impact of the welfare model on the immigrant female domestic workers is conditioned by the fact that the state provision of the care services shapes the demand and supply of the care work. In the countries where the provision of this service is limited there is a greater demand for the immigrants' domestic workers. Though, according to the studies, it must be said that due to the changes which are related to the increased privatization of care services and market de-regulation the demand for the domestic workers is growing in the remaining three models of welfare states.

Spain represents a Southern European welfare state model, which offers fewer public services for the elderly people and children. Spain like other European countries faces the problem of aging population who are becoming dependents due to their limited abilities or illnesses. This fact together with the existence of disabled people and children creates an increased demand for the care providers.

Spain is a familistic country and the Constitutional legislation recognizes the significant role of the family in the care provision for the dependents. It is a state where the key role to provide care rests with the households and the availability of public services with this aim is limited. This situation is complicated by the fact that within the families care provision is not distributed equally between men and women, and consequently females are considered to fulfill this commitment.

²⁴ Rubin, J. Rendal, S.M. Rabinovich, L. Tsang, F. Janta, B. Oranje-Nassao, C. "Migrant Women in the EU Labour Force" p.5

Nowadays lots of Spanish females who are inserted in the labor market and pursue their professional careers can no longer maintain the role of a carer and unpaid domestic worker and simultaneously be the part of the workforce. So, for these women employing an immigrant female for the performance of housework is becoming increasingly convenient on the one hand, for their professional development and on the other hand, for guaranteeing more free time for themselves.

There are Home Help Service companies in Spain but when it comes to the externalization of care work, the Spanish women give preference to the employment of domestic care workers. Only 0.4 per cent of the families with care needs applied to the companies, while 7 per cent hired other employees. The reason is that private companies charge much higher fees and households, unless they are well-off, cannot afford their services while domestic care workers from abroad can provide the same service plus perform other tasks like cleaning, cooking, ironing or doing the laundry for the same salary. In addition, company representatives work fixed hours whereas the third country employees work flexible hours and live-ins, in particular, can provide 24-hour care.

It should be noted here, that when the externalization of the care work comes to the family agenda the Spanish women always give advantage to the Latino American immigrant women, firstly because they speak the same language and secondly because they have the similar culture and religion. So care work is becoming a niche for the Latino American females. As Martinez Veiga defines "When we speak of a niche we mean certain ethnic groups of immigrants form around certain jobs because of the group's cultural characteristics, skills, or opportunities that were there for them at the beginning. The niche is formed after being occupied by a sizeable number of people from the ethnic group. The belief then arises soon after that people from that group are the best suited to the job and its requirements".²⁵ Thus it is clear that the Spanish welfare state facilitates the inclusion of the Latino American women in the domestic work.

The characteristics of the care service which is included in the domestic work sector have implications to the Latino American women's professional degradation. Firstly, many of the immigrant women from this region are university graduates compared to the Spanish domestic workers who mostly have the secondary education. Secondly, in the countries of

²⁵ (2000:82) Source: Martinez Bujan, R. "The entry of female immigrants into personal home care services in Spain"

origin they have not performed similar activities to earn their living and provided care only for their family members if at all. Thirdly, their Spanish employers are not interested in their educational attainment or professional qualification and "patience and affection" are the main qualities of the employee which are underlined while selecting the immigrant care workers, though it must be said that providing care for the elderly people often requires nursing skills and immigrant women acquire them while performing their jobs without having any previous experiences.

2.4. Immigration regime in Spain

Spain has a relatively new immigration policy due to the fact that it is a so called "new" immigration country. Therefore its legislation controlling the flows of immigrants from developing countries is different from the traditional destination states of the European Union like Germany, the United Kingdom or the Netherlands.

Stage	Time Frame	Events
Stage 1: Low immigration	1950-1970	Restrictive entry laws not enforced. Low level
with net emigration		of entry. Official and social tolerance
Stage 2: First growth of	1970-1985	Illegals and legals enter in larger numbers.
immigration		Illegals enter to work. Lack of formal work
		contracts inhibit integration
Stage 3: Steps to control	1985	Increased border control
Stage 4: Control regime	1993 -	Illegal entry continues in presence of controls.
		Divided interests. Economic tolerance of low-
		wage immigrants. Xenophobic fears of settled,
		ethnically different immigrants. Policies develop
		to integrate new populations.

Table: 3 Schematic stages in Immigration Control in Spain²⁶

²⁶ Huntoon, L. (1998): "Immigration to Spain: implications for a Unified European Union Immigration Policy;" International Migration Review, Vol.32, No2; p. 427

After the inclusion in the EU the Spanish government had to adopt more restrictive immigration policies regarding the third countries as it had to be in conformity with the EU standards. So the researchers say that the development of the Spanish immigration policy was influenced by the EU requirements. The establishment of stricter entry requirements and better border control became crucial for Spain as after the access to the EU it was the both, a destination country for the third country immigrants and a transit country to the Northern and Western European states. Gradually the Spanish immigration policy transformed and adopted a restrictive and tough nature so that it is not far from the metaphor which committed Spain to the role of "watchdog" of the Southern wall of "Fortress Europe."²⁷

The first socialist government approved an Asylum and Refugee law in 1984²⁸ and in July 1985 they passed the Organic Law 7/1985 "Rights and Freedoms of Foreign Nationals," known as Ley de Extranjeria, which regulated the immigration issues. It happened a few months before the Country's official inclusion in the European Economic Community in 1986 and before immigration transformed into the issue of social concern.²⁹ It imposed tough border controls and restrictive entry criteria, for instance, short-term resident and work permits, for immigrants.

The new Law was extremely restrictive and in spite of its title which spoke about the rights of the foreigners it did not fulfill these commitments effectively. For instance, the rights of immigrants for meeting and association were limited. Among other limitations it should be noted that the presence of foreigners on the territory of Spain without the Proper authorization was defined to be a breach of law and was punished with expulsion from the country. The Law received wide criticism from the politicians, human rights groups and trade unions because of its tough aspects. Due to the intervention of the judiciary and courts the Law was somewhat softened. For example, the article dealing with the rights of meeting and association was removed after it was denounced by the Ombudsman and declared unconstitutional by the Constitutional Court. In addition, the Law did not recognize the immigrants' rights to family unification and did not refer to their access to the social

²⁷ Moreno Fuentes, F.J.: Immigration Policies in Spain: Between External Constraints and Domestic Demand for Unskilled Labour;" 2000, p.3

 ²⁸Arango, J & Finotelli, C. "Past and Future Challenges of a Southern European Migration regime: the Spanish Case;"
p 17

²⁹ Aragon, 2000

services.³⁰ So, the first law covering the immigration issues in Spain was very strict which was conditioned by the country's inclusion in the EEC.

The Foreigners' Bill of 1985 was first amended in 2000 by the LO 4/2000 and later on reformed again by the LO 8/2000, which imposed increased sanctions on irregular migration and reduced the rights of irregular immigrants and limited family reunion.³¹

It is evident that after Spain became the member of the EU its immigration policy became more restrictive regarding the third country nationals. Particular attention has been given to the border control as the EU member states are concerned with the increasing numbers of illegal immigrants who try to cross the European borders and whose numbers are not decreasing despite the strict measures adopted by the governments of the destination countries.

There are three types of residence permits for the third country nationals: tourist permits of 90 days; temporary residence permits which are valid up to five years and are given to those immigrants who have work permits, who can support themselves, who have lived in Spain for at least five years, or for humanitarian reasons; permanent residence permits given to those immigrants who have lived in Spain for at least five consecutive years with a temporary residence permit.³² However a growing number of illegal immigrants is present on the territory of Spain and they are irregularly employed in different areas of the labor market, usually low-paid and unskilled. The involvement of undocumented immigrants is a result of the country's labor market demand for the immigrants' work in sectors like agriculture, construction business or domestic work and services. Despite the unemployment rates existing in the country among the native citizens there is still place for the immigrants' inclusion because high-skilled Spanish labor force prefers to be unemployed rather than being employed in the low status jobs. With respect to the illegally working and residing migrants the Southern European states have adopted regularization programs which give the third country nationals the opportunities to legalize their stay in the host countries.

³⁰ Moreno Fuentes, F.J.: Immigration Policies in Spain: Between External Constraints and Domestic Demand for Unskilled Labour;" 2000, pp. 10-11

³¹ Arango, J & Finotelli, C. "Past and Future Challenges of a Southern European Migration regime: the Spanish Case;"

p 18

³² Zapata-Barrero; 2003

Southern European countries have particular programs, called regularization programs, dealing with illegal immigration. These measures are adopted in order to legalize undocumented immigrants residing in the host countries. Spain has conducted six regularization programs since 1985 so far. The first regularization program was authorized under the 1985 Law and dealt with the foreigners who had job offers and who had been in Spain before 24 July 1985. However, only over half of the immigrants who applied was regularized and almost 50-75 per cent did not apply for the program. The second regularization program was implemented in 1991and targeted the immigrants who had been working and living in Spain since 15 May, 1991 and asylum seekers whose applications were rejected or pending. The third program of 1996 referred to the immigrants who had become illegal because of not renewing their documents from the previous regularization procedures. The forth and the fifth procedures were conducted in 2000 in compliance with the Law of January 2000. The last regularization program called Normalization process was conducted in 2005. Under this procedure the immigrants had to apply through their employers and it granted them a renewable work permit for one year.

It should be mentioned that Spain received a severe criticism from other EU member states because of the last regularization program. The governments of the European countries declared that this procedure could foster the increase of irregular immigrant flows because they could count on the further similar programs as well as it demonstrated the chances of being employed in case of irregular stay in the country.³³

Speaking about the immigration regime in Spain the researchers also mention the adoption of the quota system by the country, which was related to the employment of the third country nationals by the Spanish employers. Again, this step became necessary because of the need of foreign workforce in the low-skilled sectors of the Spanish labor markets. The immigration quotas were published and established every year by the Ministry of Labor after consultations with the Superior Council for Immigration Policy, trade unions and employer associations and took the employers demands into consideration. Quotas were allocated for the countries which had bilateral agreements with Spain and they were transferred by the Spanish Consulates and Embassies in the sending countries. In the 1990s the majority of the quotas were allocated for the construction and domestic

³³ Levinson, A. (2005): "The Regularization of Unauthorized Migrants: Literature Surveys and Country Case Studies"

work sectors and Ecuador and Colombia received a significant number of quotas. Though, the researchers note that the quota system was used for the legalization of the irregular immigrants already residing in Spain rather than importing them from the countries of origin.

When following the gradual formation of the Spanish immigration regime one would notice that the process is influenced by the acquisition of the EU membership, which gave Spain the obligations stemming from the EU immigration priorities. The country has adopted and amended law concerning the third country nationals but it is noticeable that particular attention has not been given to the growing female immigrant flows who are employed in the domestic work sectors. So it can be said that the Spanish immigration policy deals with the general issues regarding foreigners and there is not specific consideration paid to the circumstances of the immigrant women who are mostly exploited and exposed to vulnerabilities in the private households.

Chapter 3: Theory

I decided to apply the normative migration theory to my work. Namely I use "Normative Theory: A Social Choice Theoretic Approach" which is elaborated by Douglas Nelson.

According to Nelson normative theories of social choice pay particular attention to individuals as main subjects of their interests. Once a certain state distinguishes between insiders and outsiders the problems of international distributive justice and just migration policy come to the surface. In his paper Nelson focuses on the second problem thus contributing to the existing normative literature on international migration.

Nelson considers a world with two countries: home and foreign. The former elaborates a set of migration policies and policy-makers desire to choose the best policy which, in a liberal theory, must take the preferences of affected individuals into consideration. What complicates things is that home residents (host country nationals) and foreign residents (potential immigrants) are affected by the policies but they are affected in different ways and evaluate the policies differently as well. As a rule, policy-designers give preference to the interests of home nationals. According to Nelson the interests of foreign nationals should also be taken into account. However, it is not necessary that they must be given equal considerations to the interests of home residents. In his work Nelson attempts to derive a social welfare (decision) function from a set of primitive value judgements.

At first Nelson gives his analysis within a simple welfaristic framework. He assumes that all the individuals from the home country are identical as well as all the individuals from the foreign country are identical too. When there are alternative policies preference is given to the interests of home residents during the policy evaluation. So there exists the homeresident first rule which gives the priority to the welfare of the home resident when alternative immigration policies are to be decided. The welfare of immigrants can influence the evaluation of alternative policies only when the home residents are indifferent to the alternatives.

Then Nelson proceeds within a simple non-welfaristic framework. He states that immigration also considers the diversity of the society. Migrants bring their diversities to the host countries which must also be taken into account as they have their own value. Among home residents and foreign residents there can be different degrees of diversity with respect to the alternative policies. According to home-resident-first-immigrant-welfare second rule, in case of home residents' indifference towards the alternative policies the privilege is given to the immigrants' welfare over diversity. However, the home-resident-first-diversity –second rule evaluates the immigration policies according to home residents welfare first and if they are indifferent, the diversity is called for and put above the immigrants' welfare two policies.

Afterwards Nelson discusses a welfaristic approach. He considers that individuals' interests are defined by their welfares only. In a limited case the unanimity of home residents should be respected. It means that if there is a pair of alternative policies and a profile of individual preference orderings, the alternative which is unanimously favored by the home residents is ranked higher even though the other alternative is favored by the potential emigrants. Consequently decision makers follow the priority-of-home-residents rule while evaluating policies, that is, the unanimity of home residents has the first priority and the unanimity of the immigrants has the second priority.

Thus normative migration theory pays attention to the aggregation of individual interests regarding policy evaluation. Individuals are considered to be both home residents and potential immigrants and interests are discussed as welfares and diversity which immigrants brought to the host country. It should also be noted that within the framework of Nelson's paper individual welfares and diversities of home residents and immigrants are not compared interpersonally.

Now if we apply the theory elaborated by Nelson to the circumstances of the third country immigrant women it becomes clear why the foreign women in most cases face the underestimation of their educational and professional capabilities. In my paper I have demonstrated the case of Spain where the domestic work sector is dominated by the women from Latin American countries, whose jobs in the private households and qualifications are irrelevant, the latter being ignored by their employers at all.

From the normative migration theory perspective all individuals are identical which means that the women of the host countries and the women from the third countries are divided into two groups, each of them having its own interests and priorities. As the individuals are considered identical there seems to be no significant difference between the migrants of the good educational or professional background and those having poor level of these assets. So the immigrant from the third country is seen as an individual with less personal capital than the natives of the host country and doing the low status domestic work by her seems natural because the representatives of the third countries are generally regarded to lag behind the nationals of the developed world in their level of personal advance.

The further point of Nelson highlights the fact that while making decisions the policymakers always take into consideration the priorities of their country's nationals even if they are in the minority and the priorities of the foreign citizens are given attention only in case the nationals of the host country are indifferent between the existing alternatives of the future decision. Here we can see why too little attention is given practically to the third country women's involvement in the domestic sector. The demand for the foreign workforce in the labor market has been generated by the increasing participation of the European women in the paid work. To be able to pursue their professional careers they need someone who will fill the gap in the household which emerges when the housewife transforms into the employed women. Usually immigrant women are found to be remedies for the native women of the host countries. The third country national females often come the destination countries with certificates at hand hoping to receive better opportunities but end up with doing the work some of them have never ever performed before. The existing jobs relative to their qualifications are not available for them. Their diplomas and certificates are not recognized by the host country. And it is not surprising because the state always thinks about the considerations of its nationals at first. If the immigrant and national women get equal access to the labor market it means that they will engage in competition and consequently the employment chances of the receiving country's citizens will be reduced. As they will not start working as domestics in private households they will became unemployed. It is in the state's interests to maintain well-being of its nationals so the immigrant women occupy the places where they will not pose threats to the national females' labor force participation.

Conclusion

In the paper I presented the issues related to immigration with the particular attention to the recent phenomenon of the female migration in the EU. I tried to demonstrate the conditions of the third country immigrant women, especially those who are involved in the domestic work sector in the EU. What drew my interest to this specific area is the fact that the educational level and professional qualifications of a lot of domestic workers are not relevant to their jobs and this category of immigrant females are overqualified for the responsibilities they perform in private households. Still, their participation in this sector is not declining. Some researchers argue that these female migrants face professional downgrading and some argue that they get empowerment through immigration. I would say that third country immigrant women undergo professional degradation rather than gain empowerment because working in the low status employment area has more disempowering implications if we take into consideration the fact, that female immigrants do not enjoy much freedom of choice, do not have power to influence their employers attitudes and working conditions and finally, they are increasingly dependent on their employers when it comes to the prolongation of their work or residence permits.

In my paper I discussed the case of Spain and presented results shown by this country with respect to the immigrant women's major occupational sector. The description can be generalized and applied to all the member states of the European Union, as it is noticeable in every country that the third country immigrant women are mostly employed as domestic workers under more or less similar conditions. The case study demonstrated that immigrant workers from non-EU states fill the places which are unattractive and undesirable for the locals of the host countries. When the European women want to start professional development, find more time for leisure activities or just demonstrate their high social status, third country immigrant women, usually low-paid and less demanding, are there to help them in their households. The fact, that Latin American immigrant women often have good educational attainment and in the host countries perform the work which they would not do in their countries of origin underlines that they are aware of the low status of their jobs. Therefore domestic work is also associated with psychological and emotional hardships, especially when domestics have to take care of the children and the elderly. It is because caretakers have to show their love and attention to the members of

the employers' family. Even when the elderly people are too demanding or pretentious and are in need of 24-hour-care, domestics should show patience and affection if they want to maintain their jobs. Immigrant women are ready to cope with the difficulties associated with the domestic work as they come to the host countries with the aim of enhancing their families' income and guaranteeing good future for their children. So the main driver of their economic immigration to the EU is the support of their households rather than the benefits acquired through empowerment. In the EU member states they truly receive the financial benefits because the salaries they get in their host countries are higher than those in their home countries, however, it happens at the expense of their professional degradation.

In the recent literature there is much discourse about the empowerment of women through migration as it demonstrates decision-making power of women, their increased participation in their family affairs and enhances their experience in general. However, looking at the living and working conditions of the third country immigrant women in the European households, I would say professional degradation and deskilling outweighs the benefits of empowerment.

Immigrant women are limited in making their choice among different types of works. The so called "3D" jobs, that is dirty, difficult and dangerous offered by the domestic work sector is in most cases the only chance for the immigrant to start economic activity in the destination country. When they are underpaid or mistreated by their employers, they cannot leave their working place because of the fear of becoming unemployed or encountering a worse employer. So, how can it be said that they are empowered, when the majority of them face difficult physical and emotional pressures in the host families?

Some of the immigrant women start their own business on the return to their countries of origin. They become empowered this way but only in their home countries, as regards the receiving state, they have done irrelevant jobs there, which is the aspect of disempowerment.

In addition the majority of the married women migrate because they want to accommodate their families in a better way. The well-being of their children is their first priority and therefore they tolerate the hardships associated with the working conditions. So when they make the decision of immigration for the working purpose, they do not think of their personal empowerment. Rather, the financial support stands on the family agenda. Therefore the empowerment which some women truly receive from the immigration does not refer to all the women.

The fact that the third country immigrant females in the EU experience professional downgrading through their involvement in the domestic sector was supported in the paper by means of the normative migration theory, which states that the accommodation of its nationals' interests represents the main priority of the policy decision makers and therefore the state immigration regimes do not support granting of relevant jobs to foreigners.

As a concluding remark, I would say that presently the third country national immigrant women in the European Union, who have secondary or tertiary education and professional qualifications, face professional downgrading and it is resulted from the labor market demand of the host countries. And the need for foreign female labor in the European countries is fostered by the increased labor market participation of the national women of the host countries, who prefer to employ other women for the performance of their household responsibilities and start their career development themselves. The "others" have to satisfy the demand of the sector of the labor market which is open to them and up to now low paid and low status working positions are given to them because the rest is defined for the satisfaction of the citizens of the receiving countries.

References

- 1. Anderson, B. (2000) "Doing the Dirty Work? The Global Politics of Domestic Labor"
- 2. Anthias, F. Lazaridis, G. (2000) "Gender and Migration in Southern Europe: Women on themove"
- Lutz, H. (2008) "Migration and Domestic Work: A European Perspective on a Global Theme"
- 4. Kofman, E. (2000) "Gender and International Migration in Europe"
- 5. Al-Ali, N. "Women, Gender and Migration in Europe"
- Amuedo-Dorantes, C. and Rica, S. (2006) "Labor market assimilation of recent immigrants in Spain"; IZA Discussion Paper No. 2104
- Anderson, B. (2006) "A Very Private Busines: Migration and Domestic Work;" Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, Working Paper No 28
- Anton, J.I. Bustillo, R.M. Carrera, M. "Raining stones? Female immigrants in the Spanish Labor Market;" Department of Applied Economics, University of Salamanca(Spain)
- 9. Arango, J & Finotelli, C. "Past and Future Challenges of a Southern European Migration regime: the Spanish Case;" IDEA Working Papers; No 8, May 2009
- 10. Ayres, R. Barber, T. (2006) "Statistical Analysis of Female Migration and Labor Market Integration in the EU"
- 11.Biffl, G. (2008) "Migrant Women and Youth: The Challenge of Labour Market Integration"
- 12. Campani, G. (2207) "State of the Art Spain: Spanish Literature from Migrant Women to Gender and Migration "
- 13. Carling, J. (2005) "Gender Dimension of International Migration;" Global Commission on International Migration; Global Migration Perspectives No.35;
- 14. Dobner, M. and Tappert S. (2010): "Female migrant domestic workers and their Spanish employers in times of crisis: A comparative analysis of consequences for women on both sides of the coin."
- 15. Domiggues Mujica, J. Guerra Talavera, R. (2006) "Domestic Service and the Labour Market in Spain: A Gender Perspective on Migration;" pp.95-112
- 16. Escandell, X. Ceobanu, A. (2009) "Anti-Immigrant sentiment and Welfare State Regime in Eerope;" CCIS Working Paper 178

- 17. Fernandez, C. Ortega, C. (2006) "Labour Market Assimilation of Immigrants in Spain: Employment at the Expense of Bad Job Matches?"
- Galotti, M. (2009) "The gender dimension of domestic work in Western Europe"; International Migration Papers No. 96
- 19. Ghosh, J. (2009) "Migration and Gender Empowerment: Recent Trends and Emerging Issues;" Human Development Research Paper; UNDP
- 20. Huntoon, L. (1998) "Immigration to Spain: implications for a Unified European Union Immigration Policy;" International Migration Review, Vol.32, No2, pp.423-450
- 21.Kofman, E.(1999) "Female "birds of passage" a decade later: gender and immigration in the European Union; "International Migration Review, Vol. 33, No2, pp. 269-299
- 22. Leon, M. "Migration and Care Work in Spain: the domestic sector revisited"
- 23.Lopez Sala, A.M. "Moroccan Migration and Policy Response in Spain: Old and New Challenges for the State."
- 24. Levinson, A. (2005) "The Regularization of Unauthorized Migrants: Literature and country Case Study;" COMPAS
- 25. Lutz, H.(2008) "Gender in the Migratory Process"
- 26. Martinez Bujan, R. "The entry of female immigrants into personal home care services in Spain"; University of A Coruña (Spain), Faculty of Sociology
- 27. Moreno Fuentes, F.J. (2000) "Immigration Policies in Spain: Between External Constraints and Domestic Demand for Unskilled Labor"
- 28. Nelso, D. & Xu, Y. (2001) "Normative Migration Theory: A Social Choice Theoretic Approach"
- 29.Oishi, N. (2002) "Gender and Migration: An Integrative Approach;" The Centre of Comparative Immigration Studies; University of California; San Diego; Working Paper 49
- 30. Omelaniuk, I. "Gender, Poverty Reduction and Migration;" World Bank
- Oso Casas, L. & Garson, J.P. (2005) "Migrant Women and the Labor Market: Diversity and Challenges." OECD and European Commission Seminar
- 32. Pareja Esteway, M. Turmo Garuz, J. Garcia Ferrando, L. Pradel I Miquel, M. (2009) "The Magnetism of Barcelona: The View of Transnational Migrants;" ACRE report

33.Pellegrino, A. (2004) "Migration from Latin America to Europe: Trends and Policy Challenges;" IOM Migration Research Series No.16

34.

- Reher, D. Requena, M. (2009) "The National Immigrant Survey in Spain: A New Data Source for Migration Studies in Euroepa;" Demographic Research; Vol. 20, Art. 12, pp. 253-278
- 36. Riano, Y. (2005) "Women on the Move to Europe: A review of the Literature on Gender and Migration"
- 37. Riano, Y. (2003) "Migration of skilled Latin American Women to Switzerland and Their Struggle. for Integration"
- 38. Rio, C. & Alonso-Villar, O. (2010) "Occupational Segregation of Immigrant Women in Spain;" Society for the Study of Economic Inequality; Working Paper Series
- 39. Rubin, J. Rendal, M.S. Rabinovich, L. Tsang, F. Janta, B. Oranje-Nassau, C. "Migrant Women in the EU Labor Force;" Summery Findings; RAND Europe; Technical report
- 40. Salt, J. (2002) "European International Migration: Evaluation of the Current Situation;" European Population Papers Series No. 5; Council of Europe
- 41. Villegas Londono, N. (2008) "Social Impacts of Colombian Migration to Spain: Women's Changing Position within the Now Transnational Family"
- 42. http://www.eurofound.europa.eu
- 43. http://www.migrationinformation.org/
- 44. http://www.migrationeducation.org/
- 45. http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2006/pop945.doc.htm